

## Evaluation of the Effectiveness of the Performance Management System in the Ministry of Higher Education

Mohammad Rafee Banayee<sup>1\*</sup>, Zekrullah Faiq<sup>2</sup>, Eid Mohammad Mohammadi<sup>3</sup>, Faizulhaq Faizi<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1\*,4</sup>Department of educational management, faculty of psychology and educational science, Kabul University

<sup>2</sup>Department of Counseling, Faculty of Psychology and Educational Science, Kabul University

<sup>3</sup>Department Educational Management, Faculty of Education, Bamyan University

DOI: [10.55559/sjahss.v1i09.43](https://doi.org/10.55559/sjahss.v1i09.43)

Received: 07.08.2022 | Accepted: 31.08.2022 | Published: 05.09.2022

### Electronic reference (Cite this article):

Banayee, M. R., Faiq, Z., Mohammadi, E. M., & Faizi, F. (2022). Evaluation of the Effectiveness of the Performance Management System in the Ministry of Higher Education. *Sprin Journal of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences*, 1(09), 457–467. <https://doi.org/10.55559/sjahss.v1i09.43>

### Copyright Notice:

© 2022 Author(s). This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (CC-BY 4.0 : <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>), allowing third parties to copy and redistribute the material in any medium or format and to remix, transform, and build upon the material for any purpose, even commercially, provided the original work is properly cited and states its license.

### ABSTRACT

The main objective of performance assessment is to manage to provide the necessary information about the personnel employed in the organization to be available to managers in order to make appropriate decisions to promote the quality and quantity of employee work. The main objective of this article is to evaluate the effectiveness of the staff performance management system in the Ministry of Higher Education. This is descriptive research in terms of data collection method and in terms of purpose tactical research and in terms of qualitative and quantitative analysis. The statistical population of this study is all employees of the ministry (720); the indicated assembly (72) was determined with a confidence level of 90 percent and a sampling error of 10 percent using Crecy and Morgan formulas. The most important findings of the research showed that Performance management in the Ministry of Higher Education had created a conducive environment for better performance among employees up to a limit, but this system has not produced the effective results that it was supposed to produce in improving employee performance, but there has been a series of problems and inadequacies, and evaluation performance management does not form the basis of the reward system in this organization, and the performance management of the work in this ministry is not so tangible that all employees have same the reception and have a theme opinion about it.

**Keywords:** performance evaluation, effectiveness, performance improvement, assessment, employees, performance management

### 1. Introduction

Nowadays, concepts such as successful organization, stability, progress, and transcendence are the concepts that promote managerial studies. A high-performing organization is an organization that, over a long period of time, manages to adapt well to

technological change and advancement, build a coherent, purposeful structure, improve key capabilities, and treat employees as their primary asset, to achieve better results than the rival organization achieves.

To achieve this goal, they must first examine their organizations' practices and policies, then continually improve organizational performance by evaluating, reengineering, and changing management processes. Improve the organization's processes. It should be noted that in the context of new organizational psychological approaches, the study of workforce status, careful study of the organization, and how to apply the principles of organizational change behavior with respect to the organizational practices of organizational management have been seriously considered. These principles and the application of behavioral analysis theories in organizations are known as "performance-based management", generally speaking, performance management is the realization of performance because, over the last two decades, many organizations have both internally and externally at three levels: organizations, different departments, and staff.

Investigating the concepts of performance-based management, studying the components and features of this approach, reviewing the factors that contribute to the development of positive management practices in organizations, and evaluating the effectiveness of the performance management system at the Ministry of Higher Education are important topics discussed in this research. The purpose of the research questions is to analyze the performance management system in the organization.

The Ministry of Higher Education has (720) staff, four senior staff and eighteen heads of higher education affairs and is responsible for providing scientific services.

Evaluating the annual performance of employees and reflecting on their results in all matters is a continuous process by which employees are formally assessed at regular intervals. Recognizing strong employees and rewarding them and thereby motivating employees to improve their performance is one of the main causes of annual performance appraisal.

However, performance management or performance appraisal has a direct impact on an organization's productivity and success. Performance Management After selecting and hiring in the organization, considering their effectiveness is one of the central tasks of human resource management, staff evaluation and performance management in the organization are assumed to ensure organizational growth and progress.

Performance appraisal and how it has been managed has been a managerial and employee-centric principle since 2012, but this has had some difficulties. Annual Performance Evaluation of Employees According to the Civil Service Employees Act, the Bill of Duties, Work Plan, and Executive Reports are completed at the end of each year of each employee's term, which results in employee promotion and advancement.

It is worth noting that the evaluation of the effectiveness of performance management in the Ministry of Higher Education is the subject of this study, and by conducting this research, it will be clear whether performance management is effective in the organization.

Evaluating employees' performance and annual performance is one of the most important and difficult aspects of performance management. And how this process is managed is directly related to the efficiency and effectiveness of the organization. And the benefits of employees and the organization are also served.

Performance management is one of the best practices in building good and meaningful relationships between managers and employees, employers and workers - across all small and large government, private, manufacturing, and service units.

Employee performance management indicates whether employees are performing assigned tasks that are not assigned to their job description, thereby identifying employee shortcomings and weaknesses and identifying them in a variety of ways, such as guidance and training. They will be eliminated.

Therefore, this research is considered necessary based on the importance of the subject. Performance management is one of the mechanisms by which employees can improve their capabilities and generate a competitive advantage by producing new qualities for the organization. Performance-based management enables the organization to move toward its goals while maintaining integrity. Deploying performance management has many accomplishments, including operating system prosperity, promoting effective leadership, and enhancing organizational productivity.

### **1.1 Research Objective**

The main purpose of this study is to evaluate the effectiveness of the performance management system, its importance, role, flow, challenges, and how it performs in the Ministry of Higher Education. It also pursues the following implicit goals:

- Review the performance evaluation process of the Ministry of Higher Education staff.
- Identify the challenges in assessing the performance of Ministry of Higher Education staff.
- Examine how the Ministry of Higher Education operates.

### **1.2. Research Main question:**

Is the performance management system effective at the Ministry of Higher Education?

#### **1.2.1 Research sub-questions**

- How is the performance of the Ministry of Higher Education staff evaluated?
- What are the current challenges in the way of performance evaluation?
- How is the effectiveness of performance at the Ministry of Higher Education?

## **2. Literature Review**

### **Theoretical foundations of research**

#### **1. Definitions and concepts of performance management**

Performance management is the continuous process of identifying, measuring, and developing the performance of individuals and teams and aligning them with the strategic goals of the organization; therefore, it requires continually targeting, observing performance, training, and providing feedback, so that the performance of the individuals toward the goals Organization (Qolipour, 2012).

Performance appraisal is a process that systematically describes the capabilities and weaknesses of employees with respect to their jobs at specific intervals (Zarei Matin, 2014).

Performance appraisal is the process by which employees' performance is monitored and formally assessed at a given interval (Saadat, 2005).

Performance appraisal is the formal step to evaluate and inform employees about the way they work, the responsibilities assigned to them, and the attributes they want, as well as identifying their potential talents to bring them to different heights (Abtahi, 2002).

## **2. Performance Management Goals and Functions**

The performance management system directs activities toward strategic goals and is an effective guide for human resource decisions (such as payroll, promotion, retention, maintenance, and encouragement), identifies the strengths and weaknesses of staff providing valuable information for human resource development. Identifies staffing talents, identifies training needs, and provides valuable documentation for re-evaluating selection criteria and tools. It should be borne in mind, however, that the performance management system should encompass all the functions of the organization.

The performance management system must be relevant, specific, practical, equitable, objective, systematic, standard, ethical, yet reliable, valid, and explicit. Employee performance management results can be used in:

Human Resource Planning System, Employee Recruitment System, Selection System, Training, Staff Development, Career, and Alternative Career System, Salaries and Benefits System (Gholipour, 2012)

## **3. Performance management process**

In order to deploy a performance management system, the mission or mission of the organization and its strategic goals must be taken into account. Once this issue is clarified, the focus should be on jobs. Job analysis, in which the key components of a job are identified, is a prerequisite for performance management. Once these components are clarified, it is possible to determine what knowledge, skills, and abilities are needed for the job. Knowledge refers to the information needed to perform a job created by doing work in the past. Ability refers to having physical, emotional, intellectual, and psychological abilities. Job descriptions are essential for a performance management system that provides criteria for measuring performance. Some of these metrics refer to behaviors, how we do it, and some to the results, such as quantity, quality, cost, time, etc., of the performance.

All staff in the organization should be aware of the details of the performance management system, so it is advisable for supervisors and staff to discuss it together so that everyone is convinced of the need to do so. In this case, behaviors, outcomes, and development plans must be presented. It should be borne in mind that employee engagement should not start during implementation but should also be involved in the planning process of performance and even performance evaluation (Gholipour, 2012).

## **4. Performance evaluation elements**

Elements of performance appraisal are Adherence to goals, job analysis, and measurement. Having clear goals and strong organizational commitment makes the performance appraisal system meaningful for supervisors and employees. Job analysis provides the background for providing job information that is used to create a performance appraisal system as well as writing job descriptions or organizational positions. Measurement-related issues include validity, accuracy, bias, and time problems (Arya, 2013).

## **5. Reasons for using performance appraisal**

Performance appraisal, staff appraisal, and competency grading are the most important tasks of supervisors. If people do not reflect on their performance, there is little or no learning or behavior improvement. In order to increase positive behavior and eliminate inappropriate behaviors, it is essential that employees have the right information about the effectiveness of

their duties and responsibilities. The fundamental principle of using performance appraisal is to maximize the efficiency of employees by identifying and investing in their capabilities. Performance evaluation, in addition to providing information feedback, performs other tasks within the organization. Some of the most commonly used performance appraisals can be summarized as follows:

- Determining the appropriate system for increasing remuneration based on performance criteria.
- Determining promotions and transfers based on the strengths and weaknesses of the employee.
- Determining employees who should be redeemed or dismissed based on their performance.
- Determining training needs and evaluation methods by identifying weaknesses.
- Promote effective inter-organizational communication by creating a dialogue between supervisors and subordinates.
- Observance of state laws and regulations as a measurement criterion for the validity of employment criteria (Ghazni 2014).

## **6. Why should performance be evaluated?**

For three main reasons, bosses evaluate subordinate performance. First, evaluation provides important information on how to promote and increase salaries and make decisions. Second, evaluation allows the boss or subordinate to take action to remedy the defect and not allow the root or weakness of the root to be recognized and reinforce the good or the right things he or she is doing under the hand. At the end of the evaluation, the evaluation can determine one's future career path by creating opportunities for examining work plans in light of the situational strengths exhibited (Dessler, 2005). Some of the reasons for using a job performance appraisal are 1. Determine the appropriate wage increase and benefits based on employee performance measurement. 2. Identify the people who must be relocated or relocated. 3. Identify the people to be terminated. 4. Identify staff training needs. 5. Identify people who can be promoted and employed in appropriate positions. 6. Recognize the capabilities of employees in accordance with government rules and regulations and compensate for the reduction in the ability of employees to meet the criteria set forth in the laws. 7. Understanding the behavioral characteristics and maturity of individuals in order to regulate optimal communication (Sayed Javadin, 2013).

## **8. Legal issues in performance evaluation**

For performance appraisal to be beneficial to the company and the employer, it must also be legally defensible. In fact, because courts have repeatedly observed that inappropriate employer appraisal systems are based on discriminatory rules (such as not promoting someone who has performed well but is a member of a minority group). Therefore, the scope of law must be observed in evaluations. In the course of practice, human resource management has made recommendations that evaluations should be such that they can be legally defended (Dessler, 2005).

## **9. Manpower Performance Assessment Methods**

There are several ways to evaluate performance. These include rating criteria, sensitive event logging, anatomical, the standard of work, mandatory distribution, and goal-based management, each of which depends on the nature of the tasks and purpose of the evaluation,

for example, if the emphasis is given to increasing pay. The most commonly used method of ranking, grading, or standard workflow is the use of goal-based management if the emphasis is on participation and training. For supervisory jobs, the goal-based management approach is used, and for the day-to-day staff, the standardization method is employed (Matin, 2014).

#### **10. Benefits of using a staff performance appraisal system**

1. Determining appropriate pay increases and benefits based on employee performance measurement,
2. Identifying the people who should be relocated, or relocated,
3. Identify who should be terminated,
4. Identifying staff training needs,
5. Identify people who can be promoted and employed in inappropriate posts,
6. Recognize the capabilities of employees in accordance with government rules and regulations and compensate for the reduction in the ability of employees to achieve the standards required in the laws,
7. Understanding the behavioral characteristics and maturity of individuals to regulate optimal communication (Soltani, 2009).

#### **11. Performance management achievements in the organization**

Performance management for the organization has many hidden and obvious gains, some of which are:

1. Boom is a business system that has the following outcomes for the organization:
  - ✓ Improves the performance of each individual in the organization.
  - ✓ Enhance the performance of the organization's processes and units.
  - ✓ Leads to quality products for the organization.
  - ✓ Identifies and improves areas of personal and organizational improvement.
  - ✓ Creates performance integration at the individual and organizational level.
  - ✓ All employees are forced to think and act for the benefit of the organization.
2. Production of desirable culture:
3. Promoting effective leadership that creates effective leadership for the following four types of human skills:
  - ✓ Managing focus and attention on perspective.
  - ✓ Managing the meaning and orientation of the vision.
  - ✓ Trust and trust management.
  - ✓ Managing self-esteem and self-esteem.
4. Coaching Operations:
5. The formation of the learning organization, which generally helps the management of performance in the following aspects:
  - ✓ Formation of feedback process between manager and staff.
  - ✓ Transfer of experience and knowledge between manager and staff.
  - ✓ Improving mutual development between managers and employees.
  - ✓ Managing an organization's talents by managing performance.

- ✓ Identify the capabilities and potential of the employees.
- ✓ Attracting flourishing talent among employees in the organization.

6. The operationalization of the three roles of the organization, customers, and suppliers (Soltani, 2009).

#### 4. Research findings

Table 4. 1: Characteristics of respondents

Specifications of Respondents							
Percent Dense	Percentage	Frequency	Vague	Un-answered	Sample No.	Arrangement	Specification
8.8	8.3	6				Employee	Occupation
72.1	68.1	49		4	72	Manager	
16.2	15.3	11				Order	
2.9	2.8	2				President	
7.4	6.9	5				14 <sup>th</sup> Diploma	Education
8.8	8.3	6		4	72	Bachelor	
63.2	59.7	43				Master	
20.6	19.4	14				PhD	
23.4	20.8	15		8	72	Female	Gender
76.6	68.1	49				Male	

The sample population of this study was 72 persons, three characteristics were considered as related to the respondents.

The first part comprises respondents who are leading the task of managing 49 people, which constitutes 68.1 percent of the sample population, with a density of 72.1 percent, and the second part comprises respondents Who took the lead, with 11 people making up 15.3 percent of the sample population and 16.2 percent of the population, and the third was officials with 6 people and 8.3 percent of the sample population and a dense percentage. It was 8.8. And the fourth section included people who were presidents, 2 people and 2.8 percent of the sample population, and 2.9 percent dense, so it should be noted that most respondents were characteristically low managers. Most respondents were chiefs.

Based on the characteristics of the respondents' education, they are divided into four categories, the first category being those with a bachelor's degree and 5 persons who made up 6.9 percent of the respondents and a dense 7.4 percent, the second category. Six people had a bachelor's degree and 8.3 percent of the sample population and a dense 8.8 percent, followed by a master's third with 43 and 59.7 percent with a dense 63.2 percent. It appears that the fourth category comprises PhDs, numbering 14, comprising 19.4 percent of the sample population, and it is dense to 20.6 percent. It is noteworthy that the majority of the respondents were Masters, 43 of whom were the respondents, while the least respondents were 5 with a bachelor's degree.

The third characteristic of the respondents is gender, which is divided into two categories of females and males. The first category is 15 females and 20.8 percent of the sample population and 23.4 percent of the sample population. The second category of males, according to the data, is 49 males, representing 68.1 percent of the sample population.

Table 4.2: Question Statistical Analysis Table.

Statistical Analysis	How to turn organization goals to the individual, team, or part goals	Role of performance management to clarify goals	Performance improvement by performance management	Performance management relies on agreement and collaboration	Performance management and how to understand common	Performance management encouragement	P.M Encouragement and support communication between employees	P.M feedback for individual, team, and organizational performance	The way of P.M and organization members empowerment to modify	P.M and way of goals evaluation jointly	Performance management respects employees	Performance management has reasonable and fair procedures
N	Valid 70 Missing 2	70	70	71	72	71	72	72	72	72	72	72
Mean	3.76	4.14	3.96	3.85	3.61	3.61	3.86	3.67	4.13	3.92	3.88	3.68
Mode	4	5	4	4	4	3	5	4	5	5	5	5
Std. Deviation	.908	1.040	.908	1.117	1.069	1.115	1.237	.949	1.074	1.071	1.186	1.392
Variance	.824	1.081	.824	1.247	1.142	1.242	1.530	.901	1.153	1.148	1.407	1.939
Range	3	4	3	4	4	4	4	4	4	3	4	4
Minimum	2	1	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	2	1	1
Maximum	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5

The sample population of the data collection tool in this study was a researcher-made five-item Likert spectrum questionnaire, from completely disagree to strongly agree that the data collected were analyzed accordingly.

In relation to the first question, does performance management transform organizational goals into the individual, team, departmental and instructional goals? 47.14 percent of the employees in the ministry voted in favor and 20 percent in quite a favor, while 21.43 percent voted neither for nor against and 11.43 percent against. Therefore, we can conclude that performance management in the Ministry of Higher Education has achieved this goal.

In relation to the second question, which is posed: Does performance management help clarify the organization's goals? 48.57 percent of employees strongly agree, 27.14 percent agree with staff, 17.14 percent disapprove or disagree, 4.286 percent disagree, and 2.857 percent disagree, with the Ministry of Education's performance management concluded. Excellent has helped clarify organizational goals.

Concerning the third question, whether performance management is a continuous and evolutionary process in which the function is improved over time, such information is obtained. 31.43 percent of ministry staff strongly agree, 40 percent agree, 21.43 percent disapprove or disagree, 7.143 percent disagree and 7.143 percent agree that performance management at the Ministry of Higher Education improves staff performance. Effortless.

In relation to the fourth question, is performance management rely on agreement and cooperation rather than control and coercion? This trend has been clarified in the Ministry of Higher Education: 32.39 percent of the staff at the ministry strongly agree, 38.03 percent agree, 15.49 percent disagree, 9.859 percent disagree, and 4.225 percent strongly disagree. It has been



said that performance management at the Ministry of Higher Education is said to have improved staff performance.

In relation to the fifth question, which follows, does performance management form a common understanding of what needs to be improved and how this improvement can be made? The following data shows: 22.22 percent of the employees in the ministry strongly disagree, 36.11 percent agree, 25 percent disagree, 13.89 percent disagree, and 2.778 percent disapprove namely management. Performance at the Ministry of Higher Education has improved staff performance.

Concerning question six, does performance management encourage performance management? The Ministry of Higher Education report found: 28.17 percent of the staff voted in favor, 19.72 percent in favor, 42.25 percent in neither favor nor disagree, 4.225 percent disapproved, and 5.634 percent disapproved. Therefore, we can conclude that performance management in the Ministry of Higher Education has improved the performance of the staff.

In relation to Question 7, does it support performance management and the two-way communication between staff and managers at all levels? The answer to this question is as follows: 40.28 percent of the employees of the Ministry strongly disagree, 27.78 percent agree, 16.67 percent disagree, 8.333 percent disagree, and 6.944 percent disagree. And. This information has shown that performance management at the Ministry of Higher Education has improved staff performance.

Regarding the question, does management provide continuous feedback (on the individual, team and organizational performance) to all employees? 19.44 percent of the employees in the ministry voted in favor, 40.28 percent in favor, 29.17 percent in favor, 9,722 in favor, and 1.389 in favor. The above information indicates that performance management at the Ministry of Higher Education has improved staff performance.

Regarding the question, does performance management enable members of the organization to change and refine organizational goals? Of the majority of respondents: 45.83 percent of the ministry staff voted strongly, 34.72 percent agreed, 9.722 percent disapproved, 5.556 percent disapproved and 4.167 percent strongly disapproved. This finding has shown that performance management at the Ministry of Higher Education has improved staff performance.

Does performance management measure and evaluate all performance in accordance with the goals that are jointly set? In response to this question, 40.28 percent of the employees in the Ministry of Elections voted in favor, 23.61 percent in favor, 23.61 percent in favor, and 12.5 percent in favor. This finding has shown that performance management at the Ministry of Higher Education has improved staff performance.

Answering the question, does performance management respect employees? Responded as follows: 40.28 percent of the ministry staff voted in favor, 26.39 percent favored, 18.06 percent disapproved, 11.11 percent disapproved, and 4.167 percent strongly disapproved. That is, performance management at the Ministry of Higher Education has improved staff performance.

The answer to the question is, does the management of the business have fair logic? 37.5 percent of the employees in the ministry voted in favor, 27.78 percent favored, and 12.5 percent disapproved, 9.722 percent disapproved and 12.5 percent strongly disapproved. The result has shown that performance management at the Ministry of Higher Education has improved staff performance.

Generally, the following findings are described and compared: Respondents who answered the questions were satisfied with the performance management process at the Ministry of Higher Education, except that performance management at the Ministry of Higher Education was not perceived as sufficient by all staff. Understand and look at it as one.

Therefore, there is a need to develop a system in the Ministry of Higher Education that enables all staff in the ministry to be assigned to posts based on performance management and to evaluate their performance.

Based on the results obtained from the questions raised, it is concluded that the research hypothesis (-H1) seems to be an effective performance management evaluation process.

## **5. Discussion and Conclusion**

Today, human resources are the most important resource for any organization and the catalyst for sustainable competition. Therefore, having a staff with effective performance is one of the most important factors in the success of an organization in achieving its goals. The performance management system, which is one of the main areas of human resources management, while helping to develop and improve staff competencies, helps managers to enhance the level of staff performance and therefore the entire organization. Successful design and implementation of this system require a careful and thorough study of the prerequisites, and objectives of the organization from performance evaluation and management, appropriate evaluation approaches, reward systems, and appropriate reinforcement. If these requirements are properly addressed in the performance management process, performance management can identify the part of the organization's problems and provide scientific solutions to them.

Performance management is one of the tools that can improve the performance of the workforce and make the organization gain a competitive advantage by producing quality products that enable the organization to maintain its integrity. Moving toward its goals, deploying performance management has many accomplishments, including promoting the business system of the organization, producing the desired culture, promoting effective leadership, operationalizing coaching, and forming the learning organization.

It should be noted that employee performance appraisal leads to insufficient and insightful information on promotion from the inside, wage growth, and payoffs in the event of better performance, and in the event of poor performance, which in turn motivates better work in between. Employees ultimately increase the productivity of the organization. But the important point is that employees need to be satisfied with the results and decisions based on performance management so that this satisfaction can improve the working environment in the organization.

The survey was carried out at the Ministry of Higher Education. Of the total of 7 employees of the Ministry of Higher Education, 72 were selected from the sample tables by sample size calculator, out of which 6.0 percent were male. And the number of 5 females, which accounts for 2.3 percent of the total population.

Using the structured questionnaire of the data collected and analyzed, the key findings of this study show that performance management has been effective in the Ministry of Higher Education, but it is noteworthy that the process has not yet been institutionalized in practice. It is recommended that a performance management system be developed at the Ministry of Higher Education to evaluate and enhance all staff based on their performance.

## **References**

- Abtahi, Seyyed Hossein (2002). *Human Resource Management* Tehran: Publisher: Institute for Management Research and Training.
- Amini Haji, Anahita (2016). *Fundamentals of Human Resource Management in Tehran*: Literature Day.
- Arya gave, Jamshid (2013). *Tehran Human Resources Management*: Saffar Publications.
- Bayris, Lloyd. (2010) *Human Resource Management*. Translated by Mohammad Taghi Ziaei Bigdeli, Nader Aria, Seyed Mohammad Reza Ahmadi. Tehran: Koohsar Publications.
- Ghazni, Nasrin (2014). *Human resources management*. Tehran: Ney Publishing.
- Dessler, Gary (2005). *Fundamentals of Human Resource Management*, translated by Dr Ali Parsaian and Seyed Mohammad Arabi. Tehran: Office of Cultural Research.
- Dolan. Shimon L., Schuler, Randall S. (2005). *Managing Personnel and Human Resources Affairs*, translated by Dr. Mohammad Saebi, Mohammad Ali Tusi. Tehran: Higher Education and Research Institute of Management and Planning.
- Zarei Matin, Hassan (2014). *Human resources management*. Qom: Bustan Institute (Qom Seminary of Islamic Propagation Publishing Center).
- Saadat, Esfandiar. (2005). *Human resources management*. Tehran: Humanities Textbooks Organization.
- Sultani, Iraj (2009). *Self-assessment and improvement tools in human resource management*. Isfahan: Arkan Danesh Publications.
- Soltani, Iraj (2004). *Human Resource Development Platform Performance Management*. Isfahan: Arkan Danesh Publications.
- Seyyed Javadin, Seyyed Reza (2013). *Fundamentals of Human Resource Management*. Tehran: University of Tehran: Faculty of Management.
- Gholipour, Arian (2012). *Human resources management*. Tehran: Humanities Textbooks Organization.